International Academic Institute for Science and Technology

International Academic Journal of Humanities Vol. 6, No. 1, 2019, pp. 17-21.
ISSN 2454-2245

International Academic Journal of Humanities

www.iaiest.com

A comparative study of dialogue in common anecdotes of Shaikh Attar Neishabouri's works and Molana Jalal-al-Din's Masnavi (fourth, fifth, and sixth books)

Saeid Akbari Pabandi[1], Nasrin Mahdikhani[2], Mina Mahdikhani[3], Robab Afshari[4]

1. *Master in Persian Language and Literature, Technical and Vocational University, Al-Ghadir Zanjan branch, Zanjan, Iran.*
2. *Master in Persian Language and Literature, Zanjan, Iran*
3. *PhD Candidate, General linguistics, Female Teacher Training University, Isfahan, Iran*
4. *Master in Persian Language and Literature, Zanjan, Iran*

Abstract

Comparing the common stories and anecdotes of Attar's works and Molana's Masnavi and the characters' dialogue processes in them, there are seen systematic and coordinate connections and relationships which help us in better recognition of these works. Comparing the styles and components of talks including the speaker, the listener, theme, scene, time, location, etc., it gets clear that Molana undoubtedly has directly or indirectly considered Attar's stories and has focused on them as practical model for creating his anecdotes. However, the important point is that the available knowledge and information about Molana's mystical and personal life is dozen times more than the knowledge and information about Attar. Therefore, the researchers in this field should explore accurately and precisely these books and try more diligently to introduce these sages.

Keywords: Attar, Molana, Comparison, Dialogue, Anecdote.

Introduction

As a main and integrating element in story, the dialogue may play a useful and influential role. Comparing the common Molana's anecdotes's Masnavi and Attar's works, there are seen systematic and coordinate connections and relationships which help us in better recognition of these works.

The morphology of studied stories from the perspective of common dialogue components such as speaker, listener, tone, theme, scene, time and place of dialogues, and etc. may be used to understand the thoughts in Attar and Molana works.

Literature

In the following, there are some concrete examples of Attar and Molana's works and their dialogue styles have been investigated:

1- The tanner gets fainted from the odor of perfume.

DOI: 10.9756/IAJH/V6I1/1910002

Received:28 January 2019/Accepted:17 April 2019/Published:26 June 2019

In Attar's anecdote, there is no particular dialogue between the characters and the story is narrated by narrator.
In Molana's anecdote, the dialogue occurs between people, between people and tanner's brother, and tanner's brother with himself (Masnavi, fourth book, couplet 267-292).
Theer is no dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote, but in Molana's anecdote, there is dialogue between people, people and tanner's brother, and tanner's brother with himself. The topic of dialogue in both anecdotes is that the tanner gets fainted and his brother treats him.

2- Miracles of Sheikh Abdullah al-Maghrebi

In Attar's anecdote, there is no dialogue and the narrator narrates the story.
In Molana's anecdote, there is dialogue between Sheikh Abdullah Maghrebi and Sufian about the dignity and spirituality of Sheikh Abdullah (Masnavi, fourth book, couplets 598-603).
There is no dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote, but in Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue parts are Sheikh Abdullah Maghrebi and sufian. In terms of topic of dialogue, Sheikh's dignity is not mentioned in Attar' anecdote, but it is mentioned in Molana's anecdote.

3- Reason of Ibrahim Adham's migration and leaving the Khorasan

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between the familiar person and Ibrahim Adham about missed camel (Tazkare Oliya, Attar, p. 87).
In Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue is between Ibrahim Adham with himself about who dares to walk on the roof (Masnavi, fourth book, couplet 830), Ibrahim and strange creatures (Masnavi, fourth book, couplets 831-835).
The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdotes are Ibrahim and familiar person and in Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue parts are Ibrahim with himself, and Ibrahim and strange creatures. The topic of dialogue in both anecdotes is going of camel on the roof. Ibrahim Adham changes and leaves the reign.

4- Sufi who was meditating in rosery

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between Rabee Advie and her servant about seeing the creation effects (Tazkar Oliya, Attar, p. 70).
In Molana's anecdote, the dialogue is between Sufi and the nosy person about waking up and seeing God's creations (Masnavi, fourth book, couplets 1359-1635).
The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdotes are Rabia Advie and her servant and in Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue parts are Sufi and nosy person. The topic of both anecdotes is thinking about the divine creations.

5- Bayazid gives tidings of birth of Abolhasan Kharghani

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between Sheikh Bayazid and his followers (Tazkare Oliya, Attar, p. 577).
In Molana's anecdote, the dialogue is between Sheikh Bayazid and his followers (Masnavi, fourth book, couplet 1804-1834), and Sheikh Abolhasan Kharghani and his disciples (Masnavi, fourth book, couplets 1925-1927).
The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdotes are Sheikh Bayazid and his disciples and in Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue parts are Sheikh Bayazid and his disciples, and Sheikh Abolhasan Kharghani and his disciples. The topic of dialogue in Attar's anecdote is that Bayazid smells odor from Kharqan; but in Molana's anecdote, in addition to smelling odor, Sheikh Abolhasan (after his birth) gets Bayazid's follower and always attends on his tomb and solves his problems.

6- Bayazid Bastami says praise be to me, I'm such exalted

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between Bayazid and his disciples about this that Bayazid tells praise be to me, I'm such exalted and his disciples protest him (Tazkare Oliya, Attar, p. 143).

DOI: 10.9756/IAJH/V6I1/1910002

Received:28 January 2019/Accepted:17 April 2018/Published:26 June 2019

In Molana's anecdote, the dialogue is between Bayazid and his disciples about this that Bayazid tells praise be to me, I'm such exalted (Masnavi, fourth book, couplet 2103).
The dialogue parts in both anecdote are Bayazid and his followers. The dialogue topic in both anecdotes is telling of praise be to me, I'm such exalted by Bayazid.

7- Bird wills do not regret the past

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between the person and Sa've about its capture and tricks to get free (Elahi-Nameh, Attar, couplets 3704-3705).
In Molana's anecdote, the dialogue is between the bird and Khawje about its capture by khawje and tricks to get free (Masnavi, fourth book, couplets 2245-2246).
The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote is the person and Sa've, and in Molana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are bird and Khawje. The topic of both anecdotes is the capture of bird of the man and trick of bird to get free.

8- Sunnis and philosopher dialogue

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between the Malek and Dheri, people with each other, Malek and God, and Hatef and Malek (Tazkare Oliya, p. 44).
In Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue is between mystic and philosopher (Masnavi, fourth book, couplets 2833-2868).
The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdotes is Malek and Dheri, witnesses or people with together, Malek and God, and Hatef and Malek. In Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue parts are mystic and philosopher, and the narrator. In both anecdotes, the topic is incidence or eternity of world.

9- Wrath of king to his companion

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between the paraclete and God (Tazkare Oliya, Attar, p. 568)
In Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue is between the king and Imad al-Malik (paraclete) (Masnavi, fourth book, couplets 2936-2939), people together (Masnavi, fourth book, couplets 2952-2953), and peacemaker and companion (Masnavi, fourth book, couplets 2956-2959).
The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote are paracletes and God, and in Molana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are King and Imad al-Malik), people together, and peacemaker and the companion. In Attar's anecdote, paraclete's name is not stated explicitly, but in Molana's anecdote, it is explicitly mentioned. The topic of dialogue in both anecdote is companion's intercession by one of king's fellows.

10- Answering to the ignorant who said the world would be good if there would no death

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between Yahya bin Mu'adh followers about the worthlessness of world (Tazkare Oliya, Attar, p. 317).
In Molana's anecdote, the dialogue is between two anonymous persons (one aware and one unaware) (Masnavi, fifth volume, couplets 1760-1761).
The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote are followers of Ya Yahya bin Mu'adh and Yahya bin Mu'adh and in Molana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are unaware and aware persons. The topic of dialogue is both anecdotes is about the worthlessness of the world.

11- Ayaz and his chamber

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between the talebearers and the king (Mosibat Name, Attar, couplets 2521-2522), and king and Ayaz (Mosibat Name, Attar, couplet 2525).
In Molana's anecdote, the dialogue is between Ayaz and himself (Masnavi, fifth volume, couplet 1858), king and talebearers (Masnavi, fifth volume, couplets 1859-1861), King and Amir (Masnavi, fifth volume, couplets 1862-1870), Amir and thirty trustful persons (Masnavi, fifth volume, couplets 1867-1870), king with himself (Masnavi, fifth volume, couplets 1878-1879), the inspector with each other

DOI: 10.9756/IAJH/V6I1/1910002

Received:28 January 2019/Accepted:17 April 2018/Published:26 June 2019

(Masnavi, fifth volume, couplets 2070-2072), and king and Ayaz (Masnavi, fifth volume, couplet 2019) (Masnavi, fifth volume, couplet 2113).
The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote are talebearers and king, and king and Ayaz. In Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue parts are Ayaz with himself, king and talebearers, king and Amir, Amir and thirty trustee, king with himself, inspectors with each other, and king and Ayaz. The topic of dialogue in both anecdotes is accusing Ayaz to stealing and becoming clear the Ayaz's honesty and integrity. In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue between king and Ayaz occurs in the first part of story; but in Molana's anecdote, this dialogue occurs at the end part of story.
12- Sheikh becomes aware of his disciple's greediness

In Attar's anecdote, the dialogue is between Junaid and the person who complained of hunger and nudity (Tazkare Oliya, Attar, p. 376).
In Molana's anecdote, the dialogue is between Sheikh and disciple (Masnavi, fifth volume, couplets 2841-2843).
The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote are Junaid and the complaining person and in Molana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are Sheikh and disciple. The topic of both anecdotes is the fear of disciple from hunger and nudity and awareness of Junaid (Sheikh) of his intention and answering him.
13- Greedy cow

The dialogue parts in both anecdote is cow with itself. The topic of dialogue in both anecdote is greediness of cow.
14- Darwish sees that the Amis Khorasani's servants are well-dressed and adorned

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote is tattered mad and people, and in Molana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are rude person and God, king and Khwaja's servants, and Hatef and rude person. The topic of dialogue in both anecdote is complaint of rude person to God for hospitality.
15- Muslim invites the unbeliever to get Muslim in Bayazid age

The dialogue parts in both anecdote is the unbeliever and Muslim. The topic of dialogue in both anecdote is that the unbeliever gets Muslim.
16- Ayaz went seventy times to battle

The dialogue parts in both anecdotes is Sheikh Ahmad Khazruye [Ayaz] with himself. The topic of both anecdotes is fighting with ego.
17- In the party, King Mahmoud gives jewel to minister and asks how much it costs

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdote are king and Ayaz, and king's companions and Ayaz. In Molana's anecdote, the dialogue parts are king and minister, king and chamberlain, King and Ayaz, king's emirs and Ayaz, and king and old executioner. The common dialogue parts in on anecdotes are king and Ayaz, king's companions and Ayaz, and king's emirs and Ayaz. The topic of dialogue in both anecdotes is that the king orders to break the precious jewel and king's companions refrain from breaking it and Ayaz breaks it. The number of dialogues in Attar and Molana's anecdotes is 2 and 6, respectively.
18- At the night, the lover hopes for meeting his loved

The dialogue parts in both anecdotes are lover and loved. There is no self-talk in Attar's anecdote; but it occurs once in Molana's anecdote (lover talks with himself). The topic of dialogue in both anecdotes is meeting of loved and lover.
19- Balal Habashi and his passion and Khawje displeases him

The dialogue parts in Molana's anecdote are Khawaja and Balal. The topic in both anecdotes is faith of Balal.

DOI: 10.9756/IAJH/V6I1/1910002

Received:28 January 2019/Accepted:17 April 2018/Published:26 June 2019

20- Sultan Mahmoud sits on reign throne, the slave crying

The dialogue parts in both anecdotes is the same. There is no self-talk in Attar's anecdote, but it occurs once in Molana's anecdote. The topic of both anecdotes is crying of captured child and asking its reason by Mahmoud companions.

21- Sheikh Abolhasan Kharghani's disciple comes to see Sheikh

The dialogue parts in Attar's anecdotes is wife of Sheikh and Avicenna, and Avicenna and Sheikh. In Molana's anecdotes, the dialogue parts include Darwish and wife of skeikh, Darwish and people, and Darwish and Sheikh Abol Hasan Kharghani. The topic in both anecdotes is that the Avicenna (Darvish) knows the dignity, grace, and mystical ethics of Sheikh Abol Hasan.

Conclusion

According to this study, as the director of anecdotes in Molana's Masnavi and Attar's works, the dialogue has always played a key role in integrating the anecdotes of these two poets. Comparing the dialogue types in common anecdotes of these two poets, it gets clearer that Molana takes advantage of Attar's works in evolution and organization of ideas in Masnavi and considers them as a model. Comparing the common stories and anecdotes of Attar's works and Molana's Masnavi and the characters' dialogue processes in them, there are seen systematic and coordinate connections and relationships which help us in better recognition of these works.

References

Attar Neyshabouri, Sheikh Farid al-Din Mohammed, Asrar Name, correction and introduction Mohammad Reza Shafiee Kadkani (2009). Tehran: Sokhan Publication.

Attar Neyshabouri, Sheikh Farid al-Din Mohammed, Mosibatname, correction and introduction by Mohammad Reza Shafiee Kadkani (2007). Tehran: Sokhan Publication.

Attar Neyshabouri, Sheikh Farid al-Din Mohammed, Tazkare Aliya, correction and introduction by Mohammad Estelami (2011). Tehran: Zavar publication.

Attar Neyshabouri, Sheikh Farid al-Din Mohammed, Tazkare Aliya, thanks to efforts of Renuld Ellen Nicholson, Leiden (1907), Mole publication.

Attar Neyshabouri, Sheikh Farid-al-Din Mohammed, Elahiname, correction and introduction of Mohammad Reza Shafiee Kadkani (2009). Tehran: Sokhan Publication.

Attar, Sheikh Farid al-Din Mohammed, Mantegholteir, introduction to Sayed Sadeq Goharein (2004). Tehran: Cultural and Scientific Publication.

Zamani, K. (2010). Minagar of Love (Theme Description of Masnavi). Tehran: Ney Publication.

DOI: 10.9756/IAJH/V6I1/1910002

Received:28 January 2019/Accepted:17 April 2018/Published:26 June 2019